

ADULT EDUCATION QUARTERLY

Volume 51, Number 2

February 2001

From the Editors

ELISABETH R. HAYES AND ARTHUR L. WILSON 91

ARTICLES

Confessing Regulation or Telling Secrets?

Opening Up the Conversation on Graduate Supervision

VALERIE-LEE CHAPMAN AND THOMAS J. SORK 94

Expanding Theories of Career Development

Adding the Voices of African American Women in the White Academy

MARY V. ALFRED 108

Negotiating About Power, Frames, and Continuing Education

A Case Study in Public Health

KARL E. UMBLE, RONALD M. CERVERO,
AND CHRISTINE A. LANGONE 128

A Group Learning Intervention Into
How Women Learn Empathy in Prison

DEBORAH W. KILGORE 146

BOOK REVIEWS

Che Guevara, Paulo Freire, and the Pedagogy of Revolution,
by Peter McLaren

Reviewed by JOHN D. HOLST 165

A History of Modern British Adult Education,
by Roger Fieldhouse & Associates

Reviewed by JOHN A. HENSCHKE 166

Women as Learners, by Elisabeth Hayes and Daniele D. Flannery
with Ann K. Brooks, Elizabeth J. Tisdell, and Jane M. Hugo

Reviewed by CAROL LYON, CAROLE KABEL,
AND BETTY WALLACE 168

Adult Education Quarterly Book Review Policy,
Procedures, and Guidelines

170

oppressed, he never left it unproblematized. McLaren engages the debates over Freire regarding questions of race and gender and challenges advocates of identity politics to understand that

Freire believed that the ongoing production of the social world through dialogue occurs in a complex, dialectical interplay with the structural features of society such as its social relations of production, its cultural formations, and its institutional arrangements. (p. 149)

Part III of the book is dedicated to outlining the framework for "a pedagogy for the revolution of our time." Most fundamentally, the distinction that McLaren makes between critical pedagogy and a revolutionary pedagogy involves the questions of socialism and forms of struggle. Whereas poststructuralists legitimate their politics primarily on the basis of experience, Che and Freire link such "experience" to an objective economic analysis and historical materialist view of consciousness that does not divorce the "subject" from the messy terrain of the social. Freirean and Guevarian pedagogy stipulates as its aim the transformation of the means of production into the means of emancipation (p. 199).

Within the educational left, McLaren's arguments are a much needed breath of fresh air. In a daring and well-formulated critique of current postmodernist-inspired notions of critical pedagogy, McLaren challenges us to return to Freire, viewing him from a Guevarian and revolutionary perspective, which most surely calls contemporary critical pedagogues to task when presenting Freire as merely an advocate of participatory facilitating and sitting arrangements and research focused on unproblematized life stories of poor folks.

This book serves as an excellent introduction to the praxis of Che and Freire and the contemporary debates on the left over postmodernism, globalization, and the prospects for radical social transformation in our time.

JOHN D. HOLST
*University of St. Thomas,
Minneapolis, Minnesota*

A History of Modern British Adult Education by Roger Fieldhouse & Associates (1996). Leicester, UK: National Institute of Adult Continuing Education, 1996. 454 pages, £20 (paper).

The stated mission of *A History of Modern British Adult Education* is two-fold: to provide a critical analysis of the historical development of British adult education during the 19th and 20th centuries and to attempt to tackle the question of what individual and/or social purpose British adult education serves. The book addresses a general readership of those interested in adult education history. Its aim is modest. It refers to five other British histories already published and seeks not to replace but to build on the invaluable, rich, detailed, descriptive information of Thomas Kelly's *History of Adult Education in Great Britain from the Middle Ages to the Twentieth Century*. The book does not claim in any way to be the final word but acknowledges being a contribution to knowledge, tentative and fallible, which will be attacked, debated, qualified, and amplified.

The authors construct this history from a critical educational science perspective, using the term "adult education" to apply loosely to education for adults beyond initial, normally full-time and (more recently) compulsory education, after the end of "childhood" (p. viii). Their acknowledged viewpoint is that education includes teaching and learning; formal, informal, and institutionalized; happening everywhere; residential or non-residential; state-funded or self-financed; something that happens to (or is taken by) individuals and a collective activity.

The book is very logically organized. It sets forth the changing British historical and political context, with adult education moving from government paternalism to laissez-faire nonintervention, then to a reluctant, emergent, growing state support; finally, the autodidactic tradition gradually gives way to the universities opening up for working-class seekers of knowledge and enlightenment. With that background, there are 13 chapters, each focusing on the alternative views of diverse groups clearly recognized as important participants in adult education's history: local education authority, community education, literacy and adult basic education, worker education, university education, residential and nonresidential programs, independent working-class and trade union, auxiliaries and informal, vocational education, broadcasting, and open university. The book concludes by looking at the past, present, and future of adult education in Britain. The material throughout appears to be well documented. However, the issue of equity is limited to the chapter on women in adult education. Although they increased to a majority in the mid- to late-20th century, in the 1990s, the situation seemed to slip back, revealing that their "story . . . is rather like that of an arduous journey with one step back for every two steps forward" (p. 390).

A well-developed major theme illustrates the excellent quality of scholarship. Fieldhouse credits the British Ministry of Reconstruction, through the 1919 Report, as placing adult education at "center stage in the nation" (p. 5), culminating in a 1990 consensus on the desirability of lifelong learning. However, in the 1990s, adult education was subordinated to political considerations rather than wider social and economic policy goals (p. 352). In addition, the authors answer whether adult education existed for individual personal fulfillment or social development; producing a more active citizenship or better informed and participatory democracy; making good the inadequacies of schooling or just more education for those who wanted it; a primarily vocational orientation; a form of social control, or a mixture of most or all of these functions. And in a concluding summary chapter, they provide specific examples of when adult education succeeded in contributing to the nation's development and when it failed.

The authors develop an intriguing analysis about the topics. For example, they present community education as emerging from a harnessing of adult education to the professed aims of community development with its learner-centered focus. They show how perceptions about the potential contributions of British Broadcasting changed from "no more unsuitable medium for adult education" to "helping this modern revival of learning as the printing press helped the Renaissance in an earlier age" (p. 354). The Open University is described as one of the most significant educational innovations in the 20th century, predicted to reach more than 200,000 learners in any one year.

One of the major weaknesses of the book is that it has no historical chronology chart included, which could have provided a bird's eye view of the beginning, emerging, sustaining, fading, connecting, and disconnecting patterns of various elements within the overall presence of adult education during the nearly 200-year (1800-1995) period it presents. But despite

any difficulties, this book's penetrating historical analysis and encyclopedic representation of adult education makes it a must-read for anyone interested in adult education history in general and in adult education's interaction with the economic and political scene in Britain in the past two centuries. Although the book may annoy those with a more critical viewpoint, it will certainly raise numerous questions.

JOHN A. HENSCHKE
University of Missouri—St. Louis

Women as Learners by Elisabeth Hayes and Daniele D. Flannery with Ann K. Brooks, Elizabeth J. Tisdell, and Jane M. Hugo. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2000. 304 pages, \$34.95 (hardcover).

This book is a milestone in adult education literature, adding to the field a comprehensive source about women and learning. The topic of women as learners has previously been addressed, but only in segments of publications that deal with universal adult learning. This publication is a must read because in the context of the 21st century, educators are working with an ever-growing population of women returning to the classroom due to social and economic factors. Hayes and Flannery are the authors, with Brooks, Hugo, and Tisdell each contributing a chapter. All authors acknowledge their position as White, middle-class, educated women who share a perspective informed by post-structural feminist theories. This allows their individual voices to emerge while telling stories of their family and friends. There are four purposes to the book: to (a) assemble in one place knowledge about women and learning, (b) place women's learning experiences in their living and learning contexts, (c) promote an understanding of women's diversity, and (d) make recommendations for future research and practice. Finally, the authors describe this work as a commitment to political and social justice, as women make up more than half of the learners in formal and informal education in the world. All authors write in a consistent style, using personal narratives and contexts of their own work to reveal unique dimensions of women's learning.

In chapter 1, "Women's Learning: A Kaleidoscope," Flannery and Hayes introduce the story of how and why this book came to be written. The collaborative nature of the work is apparent: Through brainstorming, the authors together identified emerging themes, which became the chapters of the book. In chapter 2, "Social Contexts," Hayes tells the story of Marilyn, a Black woman born in the 1940s. The narrative highlights her struggles to be an adult student in higher education and an informal learner in the context of the family, workplace, and community. Flannery clarifies the distinction between identity and self-esteem in chapter 3. In chapter 4, Hayes clearly explains three different kinds of "voice." Chapter 5 describes types of connections women experience. Brooks sheds new light on transformative learning in chapter 6, showing how women's transformation may be different from men's and may be relational in nature. Tisdell clarifies five elements of poststructural feminist thought in chapter 7, "Feminist Pedagogies." Hugo addresses "Perspectives on Practice" in chapter 8, urging educators to reconsider their commitment to women as learners. Chapter 9, "Creating Knowledge About Women's Learning," challenges researchers to pursue further studies of women's learning and challenges practitioners to create knowledge through their